REQUEST FOR PROPOSALS

NEW CONSTRUCTION TOWNHOMES

FOR

Two Development Sites in the Glenville Circle North Area

CLEVELAND, OHIO 44106

March 11, 2019
City of Cleveland
Department of Economic Development
601 Lakeside Avenue, Room 210
Cleveland, Ohio 44114
Request for Proposals

Townhome Construction:
Two Development Sites in the Glenville Circle North Area

Mayor Frank G. Jackson’s
Neighborhood Transformation Initiative

Issued: March 11, 2019
By:

City of Cleveland Office of the Mayor
Edward W. Rybka, Chief of Regional Development

Department of Economic Development (Issuing Department)
David M. Ebersole, Director

Briana Butler, Manager,
Mayor Jackson’s Neighborhood Transformation Initiative

Department of Community Development
Tania Menesse, Director

Cleveland City Planning Commission
Freddy L. Collier Jr., Director

Due
April 19, 2019, no later than 4:30 PM EST

- All inquiries should be directed to: Briana Butler, (216) 664-2202 or bbutler2@city.cleveland.oh.us
- All proposals are to be mailed or hand-delivered directly to the Issuing Department (Economic Development). Any packet received after the date and time specified will not be accepted.
Dear Developers:

The City of Cleveland (“City”), through its Director of Economic Development (“Director”), is soliciting proposals for the redevelopment of two vacant sites in the Circle North area of Glenville. These sites are located on E. 111th Street (PPNs 120-08-070, -071, -072, -73, and -074) (hereinafter referred to as the “E. 111th Street Site”), and at 11427 Ashbury Avenue, just west of E. 115th Street, (PPN 120-09-032) (hereinafter referred to as the “Ashbury Avenue Site”) (both the E. 111th Street Site and the Ashbury Avenue Site shall be together referred to as “Development Sites”).

While your proposal will be scored higher if it includes both Development Sites, negotiations for acquisition of the Development Site on Ashbury Avenue shall be made directly with the owner of that parcel. Additional information regarding the Ashbury Development Site and the Owner’s contact information can be found in the RFP on page 6, and in Exhibit A-3.

A Pre-Proposal Meeting will be offered on Wednesday, March 27, 2019 at 11:00 AM EST at Cleveland City Hall in Room 22 South. During this meeting, City officials will be available to answer any questions regarding this RFP and the Development Sites.

Firms wishing to be considered in the developer selection process must submit three (3) print copies and one (1) electronic copy of their proposal no later than 4:30 PM EST, Friday, April 19, 2019. No proposals will be accepted after that date and time unless the City extends the deadline by a written addendum.

Sealed proposals may be mailed or delivered to the address below:

    Mr. David M. Ebersole
    Director of Department of Economic Development
    City of Cleveland
    601 Lakeside, Room 210
    Cleveland, Ohio 44114

The City reserves the right to reject any or all proposals or portions of them, to waive irregularities, informalities, and technicalities, to re-issue or to proceed to obtain the service(s) desired otherwise, at any time or in any manner considered in the City’s best interests. The Director may, at his sole discretion, modify or amend any provision of this notice or the RFP.

Should you have any questions regarding this solicitation, please contact Ms. Briana Butler at 216-664-2202.

Sincerely,

David Ebersole
Director
City of Cleveland, Department of Economic Development
VISION STATEMENT:

Through Mayor Frank G. Jackson’s Neighborhood Transformation Initiative (NTI), the City of Cleveland has identified target neighborhoods that will act as catalysts for neighborhood reinvestment. The goal of NTI is to provide equitable, healthy, and sustainable opportunities to create wealth and stabilize our neighborhoods. NTI efforts include mixed use development, single-family and multi-family residential development, and entrepreneur and workforce training opportunities to support neighborhoods heavily impacted by the economic recession.

The Development Sites are located within the Circle North area of Glenville. Circle North is a target area of NTI. A focus on targeted investment both directly along commercial corridors and in the residential areas which surround them in inherently disadvantaged communities will be critical to ensure that reinvestment in the City of Cleveland is accomplished and that market confidence is restored in communities such as Glenville.

The corridor along East 105th from Wade Park Avenue to Superior Avenue is envisioned as the hub for neighborhood retail activity, supported by the housing investment. The corridor creates the western border for the Circle North neighborhood and is one of several commercial corridors being targeted for strategic reinvestment as part of NTI. East 105th Street also serves as a hub for medical, educational, and cultural activity in Northeast Ohio.

The goal for these Development Sites is to diversify the housing options and increase residency in the area to support local retail and further contribute to the community. Creating a mix of local retail and dense residential housing is critical for long term neighborhood stability.

SITE BACKGROUND:

The City of Cleveland, Department of Economic Development is requesting proposals for construction of attractive, market-rate, sustainable and energy-efficient townhome developments on two vacant sites: The E. 111th Street Site located at 1461-1475 E. 111th Street, north of Ashbury Avenue, and the Ashbury Avenue Site located at 11427 Ashbury Avenue, west of E. 115th Street. See attached Exhibit A-1 for a parcel map and Exhibit A-2 for a list of included parcels.

The Circle North area of the Glenville neighborhood is in close proximity to University Circle and its rich assets such as University Hospitals, Case Western Reserve, Severance Hall, the Cleveland’s museums of Art, Natural History, Contemporary Art, the Cleveland Botanical Garden, and the Cleveland Institute of Art. Additionally, University Circle Inc.’s Wade Oval Wednesday brings thousands of residents from all over greater Cleveland each and every Wednesday throughout the summer to enjoy the free, outdoor, live concert series.
Glenville’s Rockefeller Park, Wade Park Historic District, newly renovated housing along Heritage Lane, Glenville Arts Campus, the renovated Doan Classroom Apartments, the nearly completed VA Fisher House short-term housing development, Glenville Circle North (The Finch Group) mixed-use development, and additional new-construction (The Orlean Company) and rehabilitated single family housing provide a strong foundation on which to build.

Convenience retail and restaurants in close proximity to higher density residential development promotes a walkable neighborhood and can impact the walkscore. Walkability is one of several metrics used by prospective residents to determine the quality of life in a neighborhood. The combination of single family housing, retail, and apartment development will help spur new investment beyond the Initiative.

The Development Sites are also located within the Greater Circle Living program area. Greater Circle Living is an employer assisted housing program created to encourage eligible employees to live near their place of work. The program provides both rental assistance to new renters and down payment assistance to new home buyers. More information about the Greater Circle Living program can be found here.

Through NTI, homebuyers not eligible for the Greater Circle Living program may be eligible for a Down Payment Assistance Program offered through Neighborhood Housing Services. Refer to Exhibit B for more information on the Neighborhood Housing Services down payment assistance program.

The City of Cleveland provides a 15 year, 100% tax abatement for new residential construction. This is another incentive to potential homebuyers. Developer is responsible for submitting an application for this incentive for each house, which can be found at the City of Cleveland Department of Community Development’s webpage. Developers seeking tax abatement for residential projects must meet the Cleveland Green Building Standards found in the Cleveland Green Building Standard Handbook. The tax abatement requires green building criteria or LEED certification.

PROPOSAL GUIDANCE:

The City will select one or two developers to move to a development agreement. If the developer is unable to secure construction financing for the project, the City will select another developer from those who responded to the RFP. Once funding and the construction timeline are finalized, the City will deposit the land into escrow. The developer will then commence construction as soon as weather conditions allow and all permits are issued.
The City is looking for the following for townhouses to be constructed under this proposal:

- Architecture must fit with that of the neighborhood.
- Selected developer must show an ability to obtain a construction loan or loans for the amount needed for the construction timeline proposed. Failure to keep an active construction timeline could result in land being redirected to other builders.
- The City of Cleveland will work with selected developers to create a marketing piece for individuals who are eligible for the Greater Circle Living and NTI Down Payment programs, as well as other interested prospective homeowners, and work to pre-approve borrowers through participating banks. The City of Cleveland is not responsible for the sale of townhomes.
- Purchase Price:
  - The City will negotiate a purchase price for the E. 111th Street Site based off of fair market value
  - Developer shall negotiate a purchase price for the Ashbury Avenue site directly with the owner of that Site:
    Russell Berusch, President
    Berusch Development Partners LLC
    216-402-8089, russell@berusch.com
- The townhomes must be completed in two (2) years or less from the development agreement.
- The City is seeking townhomes to be sold at market-rate. Homes should include a garage.
- Proposals for homes should meet the Minimum Design Standards for this RFP (See Exhibit C).
- The City will consider proposals that include a single developer for the townhome sites or multiple builders collaborating to complete townhomes each separate site. The City will select the builder(s) which submit the proposal(s) that best meet the City’s goals; however, the City reserves the right to reject any and all proposals received as a result of this Request for Proposal, or to negotiate issues so as to best serve the interest of the City of Cleveland.
- The selected builder(s) will be required to create a Homeowners’ Association (HOA).

The City encourages developers to refer to Exhibit D for a summary of the key planning initiatives for this area. Developers are to explain how their proposal is consistent with the following plans and initiatives: Thrive 105-93 Plan, and the myGlenville Master Plan.

Preference will be given to proposals that provide the best sales price and best designs and higher quality fixtures for the best quality home.

The project is to be completed expeditiously. The selected developer must execute a purchase and development agreement within 30 days of receiving the documents from the City, unless extended by mutual agreement.

The City requires the use of City-certified Minority Business Enterprise (MBE), Female Business Enterprise (FBE) and/or Cleveland Small Business (CSB) firms in subcontracting if the City provides more than $50,000 towards the homes constructed under this RFP. Cleveland residents, and low-income Cleveland residents, must be used in on-site construction if more than $100,000 of City funds are provided towards homes constructed under this RFP. The current Community Benefits Agreement (CBA) includes 15% Minority subcontractors, 8% Certified Small Business subcontractors, and 7% Female Business subcontractors, as well as 20% of construction hours to Cleveland residents including 4% of those hours for low income Cleveland residents. Submitted proposals should clearly indicate how the developer will incorporate Cleveland residents and MBE, FBE and CSB firms into the project. Additionally, developers are to address employment opportunities for youth. A sample CBA is included in Exhibit E.
Proposals with higher MBE, FBE and CSB participation and higher utilization of Cleveland Residents, low income Cleveland residents, and youth will be given more points.

The City will provide the following:

1. **Financing:** The selected developer must propose a sales price for each design proposed. The design should include a complete list of materials to be used throughout the home. The City’s residential tax abatement program applies to this project (100% for 15 years). Developer is responsible for submitting an application for this incentive of which can be found at the City of Cleveland Department of Community Development webpage.

**REQUEST FOR PROPOSAL SUBMISSION REQUIREMENTS AND DEADLINE**

The Request for Proposal (RFP) response shall include at a minimum:

- Proposed designs and floor plans for homes. Please refer to the design guidelines and standards included in Exhibit C.
- Proposed sales price for each home design, as well as a complete list of materials used in each design.
- Any market information to support the sales price.
- Proposed source of construction financing, with Letter of Intent from a reputable lender.
- An organizational chart illustrating the relationship of key personnel and project manager.
- Work assignment and experience of key personnel and project manager for the developer. Include names, titles and relevant experience of all significant staff that will be involved in the project.
- Descriptions of no more than three (3) similar projects completed by the firm’s personnel who will be involved in this project.
- A list of components that meet the green standards for tax abatement for the City of Cleveland.
- Explanation of how the proposal is consistent with the following plans and initiatives: myGlenville Master Plan, and the Thrive 105-93 Plan. Also refer to Exhibit D.
- Identification of how local youth will be involved in the project.
- Identification of opportunities for the use of MBE/FBE/CSB Subcontractors and City of Cleveland Residents for the project. Developers should indicate past performance on City of Cleveland projects (if applicable), efforts to identify and engage potential subcontractors, and proposed outreach efforts to include Cleveland residents. List of references.

Firms wishing to be considered in the selection process must submit two (2) print copies and one (1) electronic copy of their proposal **no later than 4:30 PM EST, Friday, April 19, 2019.**

The complete proposal package shall be plainly marked as shown below:

Proposal for Circle North New Construction Townhomes  
Firm Name:  
Submittal Date:  
Attn: David Ebersole  
Director of Economic Development  
City of Cleveland  
601 Lakeside, Room 210  
Cleveland, Ohio 44114
The developer’s proposal shall include a signature by a person authorized to submit and sign a proposal, the firm name, address, telephone number, the name of the person authorized to submit/sign the proposal, and his/her title, telephone number and e-mail address. If the firm’s primary point of contact is different from the authorizing signatory, the primary point of contact’s title, telephone number, and e-mail address should be included as well.

Proposals received after the designated date and time will not be considered in the selection process.

The City reserves the right to accept or reject any or all proposals and to waive informalities or irregularities in the selection process.

Should it become necessary to revise any part of the RFP or otherwise provide additional information, an addendum will be issued by the City and furnished to all firms that are on record as having received copies of the original Request for Proposal.

The City will not be liable for any costs incurred by the respondents in replying to this RFP. The City is not liable for any costs for work or services performed by the selected developer prior to executing a Development Agreement.

Unauthorized contact regarding this Request for Proposal with any City employee may result in disqualification. Any oral communication will be considered unofficial and non-binding. Developers shall rely only on written addenda issued by David Ebersole. Requests for further information or questions regarding this Request for Proposals should be addressed only to Briana Butler at the following:

Ms. Briana Butler  
Manager, Mayor’s Neighborhood Transformation Initiative  
Department of Economic Development  
City of Cleveland  
601 Lakeside, Room 210  
Cleveland, Ohio 44114  
Phone: (216) 664-2202  
E-mail: bbutler2@city.cleveland.oh.us

**SELECTION PROCESS AND TENTATIVE SCHEDULE:**

The proposals considered in the selection process will be evaluated by a committee appointed by the Department of Economic Development according to the criteria and point system presented below. The City will not release the names of committee members and requires that developers direct any written questions to Briana Butler. The committee appointed by the Department of Economic Development will evaluate the proposals utilizing the proposal evaluation criteria and report to the Department of Economic Development.

The Department of Economic Development will decide to either select based solely on the proposals or to interview the highest rated developers. Following the developer’s selection, the Department of Economic Development will initiate development agreements with the selected developers.

The sale of the E. 111th Street Site will be handled by the City of Cleveland Landbank, based on their authorization by Mayor Jackson and City Council, and based on the proposed terms of the proposal. The sale of the Ashbury Avenue Street Site shall be negotiated with the owner, as identified on page 6.
The following is the proposed schedule for this project. The schedule is subject to change at the sole discretion of the City:

- **March 11, 2019**: Distribute Request for Proposals
- **March 27, 2019 at 11:00 AM EST**: Pre-Proposal Meeting
- **April 19, 2019 by 4:30 PM EST**: Deadline for Receipt of Proposals
- **April 26, 2019**: Internal Design Review and Requests for Interviews
- **May 24, 2019**: Execution of Development Agreement

**PRE-PROPOSAL MEETING:**

A Pre-Proposal Meeting will be offered on **Wednesday, March 27, 2019 at 11:00 AM EST at Cleveland City Hall in Room 22 South**. Interested parties should RSVP to Briana Butler (216) 664-2202 or via email at bbutler2@city.cleveland.oh.us.

**PROPOSAL EVALUATION CRITERIA:**

The following information should be included in each Proposal and will form the basis of the evaluation (unless noted otherwise). The point number is the weight of each criterion. Interviews may be conducted to obtain additional information regarding the proposal.

All proposals will be scored between 0 and the maximum points established for each criterion. The points are not intended to reflect the relative qualifications of the developer for that criterion; rather it is reflective of the developer’s ranking as compared to the other proposals. A total point score of zero does not mean the firm is unqualified.

*Overall Qualifications of Firm/Team (10 Points)*

Provide a description of the overall qualifications of your firm and project team.

Provide examples (not more than three) of similar projects performed by your team within the last five years. The examples should include the nature of your involvement in the project, any special environmental or technical problems involved in the project, how the problems were resolved, the name and phone number of the owner’s representative in charge of the project, the total project cost, and when the project was performed.

Provide a list of references for work that has been completed in the last three years.

*Project Manager/Key Personnel (5 Points)*

The proposal should include the name and qualifications of the Project Manager (PM) to be assigned to this project. Include the Project Manager’s prior similar experiences on:

- Projects which best illustrate his/her expertise to perform the requested services.
- Track record in meeting schedules and budgets.
- Developing and implementing cost effective design processes.

For any projects listed, include the name and phone number of the owner’s representative in charge of the project.
Provide the identity and qualifications of Key Personnel (including both prime and sub-contractors) to work on this project, including the adequacy and appropriateness of their credentials and capabilities, expected project assignments, the extent of their project participation, and the relevance of their prior experience to this project (if any).

Provide a description of Key Personnel experience with public financing, and Federal, State and local resources. The description should include a demonstrated ability to comply with applicable government regulations.

Provide an organizational chart illustrating the relationship between the PM and Key Personnel. Identify sub developers in the organizational chart by name and firm.

**Proposed Design, Materials and Sales Price and Compliance with Existing Planning Efforts (40 Points)**

Identify the scope of work for the project. Provide the construction schedule and development timeline for the project. The maximum time for completion of the homes is two (2) years from execution of the development agreement.

Include renderings and floor plans for each design of the proposed development. The design should fit the character of the neighborhood. Provide a complete listing of materials to be used in each design, making sure that the proposed house will meet or exceed the minimum design standards in Exhibit C. Provide a sales price for each design of home.

Provide a marketing plan.

The City of Cleveland is committed to supporting healthy, sustainable development that benefits the residents of its neighborhoods. Proposals should be consistent with existing planning efforts as adopted by the City of Cleveland’s Planning Commission. Please refer to Exhibit D.

**Project Financing (30 Points)**

Indicate the amount of construction funds needed throughout the project timeline and show the ability to obtain those funds. A letter of intent from a reputable lending institution should be shown. If any developer has their own funding, the City will need to review the availability of cash for this use.

If any developer plans to provide potential homebuyers with their own financing, the information on the type of loans provided should be included detailing interest rate, fixed or variable, term, underwriting criteria, loan to value ratio allowed, collection policies, etc. The City will need to review these terms and compare to other bank financing to determine if the financing is more or less favorable than bank financing available.

**Proposed Community Benefits Agreement (10 points)**

The City of Cleveland is seeking developers who will strive to benefit Cleveland residents, Cleveland students and Cleveland certified minority, female and small businesses for this project. Exhibit E includes a sample Community Benefits Agreement.

Indicate any of your firm’s previous experience with projects funded by the City of Cleveland and your track record of compliance with the City’s MBE/FBE/CSB and Cleveland Residents regulations (Cleveland Codified Ordinances Chapters 187 & 188).
Clearly indicate how your firm will incorporate Cleveland-certified MBE, FBE and CSB subcontractors into the construction aspects of this project.

Developers without applicable experience will be eligible to receive full points and will be evaluated entirely on the proposed use of certified subcontractors and residents.

There are several vacant lots not included in this RFP. Addressing these lots through clean-up and/or landscaping efforts will benefit the community and make the Development Sites more attractive. Developers who indicate plans for clean-up and landscaping of vacant lots that are not included in this RFP will be scored higher.

**Area Youth Involvement (5 points)**

The City of Cleveland is very interested in providing an opportunity to local youth to both learn more about development in their community and to participate in the project. In the past, developers have provided internships to John Hay Architecture students to participate in the design process, as an example. In addition, the Famicos Foundation has a Youth Program to provide landscaping in the area that could possibly benefit from assisting with landscaping on this project. Donations to such a program could also be considered as helping with youth involvement.

Developers who show a clear commitment to area youth via funding and/or involvement will be scored higher.

**GENERAL FORMAT:**

All proposals shall contain concise written material and illustrations. Legibility, clarity, and completeness are essential. All submittals must have the following tabbed headings:

- Overall Qualifications of Firm/Team
- Project Manager/Key Personnel
- Proposed Design, Materials and Sales Price
- Project Financing
- Proposed Community Benefits Agreement
- Area Youth Involvement

**ATTACHMENT LIST:**

- Exhibit A-1: Development Site Location
- Exhibit A-2: Development Parcel List
- Exhibit A-3: Ashbury Site Additional Information
- Exhibit B: Neighborhood Housing Services Down Payment Assistance Program
- Exhibit C: Minimum Materials and Design Standards
- Exhibit D: Summary of Key Planning Initiatives
- Exhibit E: Sample Community Benefits Agreement
Exhibit A-1

Development Site Location

- Ashbury Avenue Site
- East 111th Site
Exhibit A-2

Development Parcel List

E. 111th Street Site PPNs
120-08-070
120-08-071
120-08-072
120-08-073
120-08-074

Ashbury Avenue Site PPN
120-09-032
February 19, 2019

David Ebersole, Director
City of Cleveland
Department of Economic Development
601 Lakeside Avenue, Room 210
Cleveland, OH 44114

Re: PPN 120-09-032

Dear Mr. Ebersole,

I understand the City is issuing a RFP for development of townhomes on certain City Land Bank parcels located in the Circle North area of Glenville through the Mayor’s Neighborhood Transformation Initiative. In addition to the available City Land Bank parcels (PPNs 120-08-070, -071, -072, -073, and -074), I am aware of the intent to include a vacant parcel, (PPN 120-09-032) located at 11427 Ashbury Avenue, within the RFP to interested developers.

As, owner of this parcel I am prepared to consider proposals from developers responding to the RFP, in concert with the City property. I am prepared to negotiate a purchase price for PPN 120-09-032, or alternatively enter into a joint venture with an interested development group.

I look forward to reviewing responses received by the City as well as participating in the future development of the Glenville neighborhood and the Mayor’s Neighborhood Transformation Initiative.

Sincerely,

[Signature]

Russell Berusch
Sole Member
11427 Ashbury LLC
Through the Mayor’s Neighborhood Transformation Initiative, the City of Cleveland is working with Cleveland Citywide Development Corporation to provide a down payment assistance program through Neighborhood Housing Services (NHS). Having consistently performed for the Cuyahoga County Department of Development, and other organizations, in administrating their down payment assistance programs, NHS is well situated to administer this program.

Greater University Circle Living (GUCL) currently offers a down payment assistance program for individuals who work in GUCL institutions. The NHS Down Payment Assistance Program cannot be layered with the GUCL program, and thus helps to fill the gap by attracting residents who do not work for those institutions.

NHS will administer the program providing down payment assistance to at least 25 homebuyers within a two-year period. Maximum down payment assistance is up to $20,000, and would be provided in the form of a forgivable loan given the following requirements:

- Homebuyers must complete the NHS Homebuyer Education course
- Loan is secured with a subordinate lien position Mortgage and Promissory Note
- Homebuyers whose income is at or below 120% AMI are required to contribute down payment of at least 3%
- All other homebuyers are required to contribute down payment of at least 5%
- Down payment assistance forgiveness shall be based on the following:
  - Client must occupy the home as a primary residence for a minimum of 5 years
  - Loan is forgiven in equal intervals of 20% of the amount of the assistance on an annual basis
Community Development Review Committee
A Joint Committee of the Department of Community Development & the Cleveland Planning Commission

MNTI – GLENVILLE CIRCLE NORTH INFILL RFP – DEVELOPMENT REQUIREMENTS

SITE 1: 11427 ASHURY

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SITE DATA &amp; ZONING</th>
<th>ADDRESS</th>
<th>PPN</th>
<th>LOT SIZE</th>
<th>EXISTING ZONING</th>
<th>ZONING COMMENTS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>11427 Ashbury</td>
<td>12009032</td>
<td>50’ x 200’-</td>
<td>MF-C1</td>
<td>▪ Townhouses &amp; Multi-Family allowed by right.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

SPECIFIC SITE REQUIREMENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ALLOWABLE BUILDING TYPES</th>
<th>MINIMUM NUMBER OF UNITS</th>
<th>SITE LAYOUT REQUIREMENTS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>TH, MF</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>▪ Protect existing street tree in tree lawn.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>▪ Locate driveway on east property line.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

MINIMUM REQUIREMENTS - TOWNHOUSES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>BUILDING ELEMENT</th>
<th>REQUIREMENT</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ALL TOWNHOUSE UNITS</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Entire Unit</td>
<td>▪ Meet Townhouse Code, Section 337.031 of the Zoning Code</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>▪ Townhouse District: RA-2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>UNITS FACING STREET FRONTAGES</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Location of Primary Living Spaces</td>
<td>▪ Locate on the First Floor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>▪ Primary Living Spaces are the living room, dining room, and kitchen.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maximum Number of Stories at Building Line</td>
<td>▪ Meet Zoning Code</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Front Porches</td>
<td>▪ Provide a front porch on each unit facing a Street Frontage.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>▪ Min. dimension: 12’ wide x 6’ deep</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>▪ Porch shall be fully covered with a roof</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>UNITS WITHOUT A STREET FRONTAGE</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>▪ The Principal Pedestrian Entrance shall not be located in the same Building Frontage as the garage door</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>▪ i.e. the front door to the unit shall face a pedestrian path, not a vehicular driveway.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Minimum Requirements: Multi-Family Buildings

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Building Element</th>
<th>Requirement</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>1) Setbacks</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Front Yard Setback; Principal Street Frontage</td>
<td>Match average Setback of existing context.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>2) Building Configuration</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Frontage Build-out at Principal Street Frontage</td>
<td>60% min.; 10% of this requirement may be met with a Streetscreen. Streetscreen shall be masonry and min. 3.5' in height.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Active Uses on First Floor</td>
<td>Required on 60% of Frontage Build-out on Principal and Secondary Street Frontages, 9' min. depth.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Floor Area Ratio</td>
<td>No maximum. Variance as permitted by BZA.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Entrance</td>
<td>Provide at least one Principal Pedestrian Entrance per building. Principal Pedestrian Entrance shall face the Principal Street Frontage.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E. Height of Finished First Floor above grade</td>
<td>24” min., 5.5’ max; Building lobby may be at 0’.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>3) Design Features</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. First-story Glazing, Principal and Secondary Street Frontages</td>
<td>40% min. of façade required to be transparent windows and doors, between 3’ and 7’ above finished floor. Where the Finished First Floor is 48” or more above grade: Min. 20% glazing is required between grade and the Finished First Floor.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Front Porches; Principal and Secondary Street Frontages</td>
<td>Required for each First Floor dwelling unit. Min. dimension: 8’ wide x 6’ deep. Porch shall be fully covered with a roof.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Materials; Principal and Secondary Street Frontages</td>
<td>Glass in any dimension is permitted. All other materials shall be Human-scaled, except materials used on building bases (up to 3’ above Finished First Floor) may be larger in size. Human-scaled materials are defined as 12” max. width in either the vertical or horizontal dimension, with the other dimension unlimited. Prohibited: Plain and split-face concrete masonry units, synthetic stucco, vinyl siding.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>4) Parking, Garages, Car Openings, and Driveways</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Parking lots, Garages, or Car Openings fronting a Principal or Secondary Street Frontage</td>
<td>Not Permitted</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Surface Parking Location</td>
<td>Screened from view at the Street R.O.W. by a building.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Alley access</td>
<td>Where an alley abuts the development site, curb cuts shall not be permitted on Principal or Secondary Street Frontages.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. One-way vehicular driveway width</td>
<td>Max: 11’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E. Two-way vehicular driveway width, serving multiple units</td>
<td>Max: 20’ max. aggregate width per Street Frontage</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F. Continuous at-grade sidewalk at drive apron</td>
<td>Required</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
**TIEBREAKERS**
Projects that meet all Minimum Requirements will be evaluated based on the Tiebreakers listed below, taken in order.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CRITERIA</th>
<th>EXPLANATION</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Provide brick on Street Frontages, and return 5’ min. on side elevations.</td>
<td>For compatibility with context.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Compatibility with context</td>
<td>▪ Scale</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>▪ Massing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>▪ Scale and type of materials</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>▪ Window proportion, orientation, and relationship of solid to void.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>▪ Presence of additive forms, e.g. porches, balconies, bay windows</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Design Quality</td>
<td>▪ Façade composition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>▪ Simple use of a limited palette of materials</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>▪ Level of detail on architectural elements, e.g. cornice, window trim, lintels</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Preserve existing site trees</td>
<td>▪ Per Cleveland Tree Plan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Number of units</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Paired Townhouse Image Example
Townhouse Infill Example
SITE 2: E. 111 & ASHBURY

SITE DATA & ZONING

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ADDRESS</th>
<th>PPN</th>
<th>LOT SIZE</th>
<th>EXISTING ZONING</th>
<th>ZONING COMMENTS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1461 E. 111</td>
<td>12008070</td>
<td>40’ x 120’</td>
<td>2F-B1</td>
<td>Townhouses allowed by Planning Commission approval</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1465 E. 111</td>
<td>12008071</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Multi-Family allowed by variance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1467 E. 111</td>
<td>12008072</td>
<td>200’ x 120’</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1471 E. 111</td>
<td>12008073</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1475 E. 111</td>
<td>12008074</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

SPECIFIC SITE REQUIREMENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ALLOWABLE BUILDING TYPES</th>
<th>MINIMUM NUMBER OF UNITS</th>
<th>SITE LAYOUT REQUIREMENTS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>TH</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>▪ Developer will split the site as shown on attached Site 2 diagram.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>▪ City Land Bank will retain ownership of the southern 62’ of the project site for use as future parking.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>▪ Developer will provide paved driveway on PPN 120-08-074, in the location shown on the diagram, to provide access to the new townhouses and future City parking spaces.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>▪ Developer will grant an access easement on the driveway for the future parking spaces.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>▪ Developer may elect to build District Parking spaces on City land for the use of townhouse residents, guests, and neighboring residents. Masonry Streetscreen required, 3.5’ h. min.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>▪ Provide street trees in tree lawn as needed to achieve spacing of 25’ o.c.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

MINIMUM REQUIREMENTS - TOWNHOUSES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>BUILDING ELEMENT</th>
<th>REQUIREMENT</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ALL TOWNHOUSE UNITS</td>
<td>Meet Townhouse Code, Section 337.031 of the Zoning Code</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Townhouse District: RA-2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNITS FACING STREET FRONTAGES</td>
<td>Locate on the First Floor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Primary Living Spaces are the living room, dining room, and kitchen.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maximum Number of Stories at Building Line</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A stepped back “camelback” third story solution is allowable: Step back 1’ from the Building Line for each 1’ vertical above 2 stories.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Front Porches</td>
<td>Provide a front porch on each unit facing a Street Frontage.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Min. dimension: 12’ wide x 6’ deep</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Porch shall be fully covered with a roof</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNITS WITHOUT A STREET FRONTAGE</td>
<td>The Principal Pedestrian Entrance shall not be located in the same Building Frontage as the garage door.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>i.e. the front door to the unit shall face a pedestrian path, not a vehicular driveway.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
TIEBREAKERS
Projects that meet all Minimum Requirements will be evaluated based on the Tiebreakers listed below, taken in order.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CRITERIA</th>
<th>EXPLANATION</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6. Provide brick on Street Frontages, and return 5’ min. on side elevations.</td>
<td>▪ For compatibility with context.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Compatibility with context</td>
<td>▪ Scale</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>▪ Massing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>▪ Scale and type of materials</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>▪ Window proportion, orientation, and relationship of solid to void.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>▪ Presence of additive forms, e.g. porches, balconies, bay windows</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Design Quality</td>
<td>▪ Façade composition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>▪ Simple use of a limited palette of materials</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>▪ Level of detail on architectural elements, e.g. cornice, window trim, lintels</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Preserve existing site trees</td>
<td>▪ Per Cleveland Tree Plan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. Number of units</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
E. 111 & ASHURY
ATTACHED TOWNHOUSES EXAMPLE
SCALE: 1" = 50'

Fence between each 20' x 24' private courtyard

STREETSCREEN

DRIVE EASEMENT

7 UNITS

5 UNITS

62' DISTRICT PARKING

10' 40' 24' 22' 24'
Attached Townhouses Examples
Exhibit D

Summary of Key Planning Initiatives

MyGlenville Neighborhood Masterplan
The "myGlenville Neighborhood Masterplan" has been adopted and will serve as the update to the existing Superior Five Mixed Use development plan adopted by the Cleveland Planning Commission in 2008. More information on the "myGlenville" plan can be found here.

Connecting Cleveland 2020:
The proposed development should also be consistent with three key development pillars: Health, Equity, and Sustainability. In addition, the development proposal should relate to the housing and retail goals outlined in the City of Cleveland’s Comprehensive Plan Connecting Cleveland 2020. More information on Connecting Cleveland 2020 can be found here.

Thrive 105-93:
The Cleveland City Planning Commission was awarded a Federal TIGER planning grant to examine the East 93rd/East 105th Street Corridor. This effort is part of the Mayor’s larger Neighborhood Transformation Initiative (NTI) which identifies target areas along several key commercial corridors. The East 105th and Superior section is flanked to the east by the Circle North neighborhood. The successful proposal will contain the appropriate density that will encourage increased transit use and provide residents with mode choices in close proximity to where they live. The number 10 bus line is a major north-south bus line and is one of the busiest routes in RTA's fleet. The intersections along the corridor have significant transfer activity along the routes. The plan identifies ways in which communities along route #10 can work together to attract new investment and foster a renewed spirit of entrepreneurship all while emphasizing their neighborhood's unique citizens, attributes, and history. More information on Thrive 105-93 can be found here.
The project involves community stakeholders in the project design, planning, and construction process. The project ownership entity, is Developer. The following actions are being taken by Developer:

1. **Cleveland Municipal School District Student Involvement**

   Before the School Year ends, Developer shall interview and select at least two students for a summer internship for each summer where the project is underway.

   Developer will include Cleveland Municipal School District students that are interested in development, architecture and engineering as project interns. This would provide students a hands-on learning experience like no other. The students would be able to shadow personnel, attend project meetings and be a part of the design process for a transformational project in Glenville and the City of Cleveland. The developer’s office will provide internships to students.

   Developer will also provide for internships at the project level and encourage subcontractors to engage young students to participate in various construction trades. The students will have the opportunities to shadow key management and construction personnel. At least two CMSD Max Hayes students will be selected to shadow management and construction personnel.

2. **Youth Employment**

   Developer will work with the City, CMSD, Famicos Foundation and other organizations to make employment opportunities available for Cleveland Youth (aged 16-25) for construction and other employment opportunities on this project. Developer will attempt to employ youth in 10% of construction jobs.

3. **Chapter 187 of the City’s Codified Ordinances**

   If more than $50,000 of City assistance is provided to a project, Developer shall meet the conditions of Chapter 187. Developer will work with any uncertified MBE, FBE or CSB’s to get them certified and will make sure that all information is entered into the City’s software tracking system.

   If no City assistance is awarded to project, Developer shall make best efforts to meet the City’s goals of 15% minority subcontracting, 8% certified Small Business subcontracting, and 7% Female Business subcontracting.

4. **Chapter 188 of the City’s Codified Ordinances**

   If City provides $100,000 or more to a project, Developer will meet the conditions of Chapter 188. Developer will make sure that all information is entered into the City’s software tracking system.

   If no City assistance is awarded to project, Developer shall make best efforts to meet the City’s goals of hiring Cleveland residents and low-income Cleveland residents. Under Chapter 188, City requires 20% of construction
hours to be completed by City residents, of which 4% of those hours to be completed by low-income residents. 
Note: Any resident hired under this provision will be counted towards the Cleveland resident requirement for a 5 year period, regardless of increases in income, per Codified Ordinance 188.01 (f), as long as they remain employed by the same contractor and remain a City resident.

5. Sustainable Business Practices-

Developer will meet all the requirements of the Residential Tax Abatement, including following the Cleveland Green Housing Handbook.

6. Hiring-

Developer will execute a Workforce Development Agreement with the City of Cleveland as part of the Economic Development Agreement, if applicable. Ohio Means Jobs will be a valuable resource for the project’s tenants to hire qualified employees.

Developer agrees to theses Community Benefits as part of the project.

Developer

By: Authorized Signator, Title

Date